Ferroelectric domain structure of anisotropically strained NaNbO₃ epitaxial thin films
J. Schwarzkopf, D. Braun, M. Schmidbauer, A. Duk, and R. Wördenweber

Citation: Journal of Applied Physics 115, 204105 (2014); doi: 10.1063/1.4876906
View online: http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.4876906
View Table of Contents: http://scitation.aip.org/content/aip/journal/jap/115/20?ver=pdfcov
Published by the AIP Publishing

Articles you may be interested in
Anisotropic ferroelectric properties of anisotropically strained epitaxial NaNbO₃ films

Anisotropic one-dimensional domain pattern in NaNbO₃ epitaxial thin films grown on (110) TbScO₃
Appl. Phys. Lett. 102, 091903 (2013); 10.1063/1.4794405

Laser beam scanning microscope and piezoresponse force microscope studies on domain structured in 001-, 110-, and 111-oriented NaNbO₃ films

Complex domain structure in relaxed PbTiO₃ thick films grown on (100)cSrRuO₃/(100)SrTiO₃ substrates

Local retention behaviors of epitaxial and polycrystalline Pb Mg 1/3 Nb 2/3 O 3 – PbTi O 3 thin films by scanning force microscopy
Ferroelectric domain structure of anisotropically strained NaNbO₃ epitaxial thin films

J. Schwarzkopf,¹,a) D. Braun,¹ M. Schmidbauer,¹ A. Duk,¹ and R. Wördenerweber²
¹Leibniz-Institute for Crystal Growth, Max-Born-Str. 2, 12489 Berlin, Germany
²Forschungszentrum Jülich, Peter Grünberg Institute, Jülich, Germany

(Received 24 March 2014; accepted 4 May 2014; published online 28 May 2014)

NaNbO₃ thin films have been grown under anisotropic biaxial strain on several oxide substrates by liquid-delivery spin metalorganic chemical vapor deposition. Compressive lattice strain of different magnitude, induced by the deposition of NaNbO₃ films with varying film thickness on NdGaO₃ single crystalline substrates, leads to modifications of film orientation and phase symmetry, which are similar to the phase transitions in Pb-containing oxides near the morphotropic phase boundary. Piezoresponse force microscopy measurements exhibit large out-of-plane polarization components, but no distinctive domain structure, while C-V measurements indicate relaxor properties in these films. When tensile strain is provoked by the epitaxial growth on DyScO₃, TbScO₃, and GdScO₃ single crystalline substrates, NaNbO₃ films behave rather like a normal ferroelectric. The application of these rare-earth scandate substrates yields well-ordered ferroelectric stripe domains of the type a₁/a₂ with coherent domain walls aligned along the [001] substrate direction as long as the films are fully strained. With increasing plastic lattice relaxation, initially, a 2D domain pattern with still exclusively in-plane electric polarization, and finally, domains with in-plane and out-of-plane polar components evolve. © 2014 AIP Publishing LLC. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.4876906]

INTRODUCTION

Domain properties in ferroelectric thin films are currently in the focus of fundamental research. Their size and symmetry as well as the nature of the domain walls have large impact on the ferro- and piezoelectric properties of thin films. Consequently, understanding and controlling of domains are essential for further application in nanometer sized electronic devices. Domain formation critically depends on the incorporated lattice strain induced by the substrate (lattice parameter and symmetry mismatch between film and substrate material), the composition, and stoichiometry of the film as well as the nature and density of defects.¹–⁶

Incorporation of lattice strain in thin films by the heteroepitaxial growth on lattice mismatched substrates can have a beneficial effect on film properties. For example, it provides the stabilization of ferroelectric phases which are not found in the bulk parent compounds,¹,⁷ or leads to a significant increase of the remnant polarization and a shift of the Curie temperature.⁸,⁹ Theoretical descriptions of strain-phase diagrams with regard to biaxial isotropic lattice strain have been provided by the fundamental work of Pertsev et al.¹⁰ within the Landau-Ginzburg-Devonshire theory and by ab-initio calculations performed by Diéguez et al.¹¹ for several perovskite based materials. For isotropic in-plane lattice strain in NaNbO₃ films, transitions from a tetragonal phase (T) with only an out-of-plane polarization component (P₁ = P₂ = 0 and P₃ ≠ 0) to a monoclinic or rhombohedral phase (R) with both an in-plane and out-of-plane component of the polarization (P₂ = P₃ ≠ 0 and P₃ ≠ 0) and finally to an orthorhombic phase (aa) with exclusive in-plane polarization (P₁ = P₂ ≠ 0 and P₃ = 0) with increasing in-plane lattice parameter have been predicted.

Generally, due to the orthorhombic symmetry of most oxide substrates and many perovskite films, substrate induced biaxial lattice strain in thin films is non-uniform, which, however, has rarely been investigated yet. This in-plane anisotropy in epitaxial mismatch strain can reduce the group symmetry of film structure, which is different to the case of biaxial isotropic strain state and may result in larger stability regions of rotational single-domain phases or multilayer states.¹² Single-domain phase diagrams have been theoretically predicted from non-linear thermodynamic simulations,¹³–¹⁶ where the formation of misfit dislocations or of ferroelastic domains to reduce energy has not been considered. Stability maps consisting of single- and multi-domain phase regions have been deduced by phase field simulations¹⁷,¹⁸ and a full scale nonlinear thermodynamic model¹²,¹⁹,²⁰ taking into account of lattice relaxation by misfit dislocations, to the contribution of micro-strain for multi-domain formation and to electrical boundary conditions (depolarization field).

A very low number of reports have described experimental results on the influence of anisotropic in-plane strain on domain formation of ferroelectric thin films.²¹–²⁴ Mostly, film-substrate combinations have been considered, theoretically as well as experimentally, where a film material with a cubic or tetragonal structure at room temperature (RT) (like PbZr₁₋ₓTiₓO₃ with x = 0.7–1, PbTiO₃ or Ba₁₋ₓSrxTiO₃ with x = 0–1) is grown on an orthorhombic substrate (like NdGaO₃ or the rare-earth scandates). NaNbO₃ based materials have attracted much interest from scientific as well as potentially practical point of view due to their promising ferro- and piezoelectric properties.²⁵ Complexity of phase

a)Electronic mail: jutta.schwarzkopf@ikz-berlin.de
transitions and interesting electric behavior under the influence of applied electric field or lattice strain.\textsuperscript{26–30} However, NaNbO$_3$ undergoes a phase transition from a para- to an anti-ferroelectric phase at 633 K and crystallizes at RT in the orthorhombic P phase\textsuperscript{28} (space group Pbcm) in contrast to the above mentioned materials.

In this paper, we report about the first systematic study on the anisotropic strain impact on domain configuration in NaNbO$_3$ thin films grown by liquid-delivery spin metal-organic chemical vapor deposition (MOCVD). The deposition of NaNbO$_3$ in thin film form is rather challenging due to the high volatility of the alkaline component. We will show that on the one hand polarization direction and piezoelectric coefficient are critically influenced by the incorporation of lattice strain and substrate symmetry. On the other hand, domain size and ordering also can be changed from a relaxor ferroelectric state to well-ordered ferroelectric stripe domains by incorporation of anisotropic compressive and tensile lattice strain, respectively, while the deposition conditions are kept constant.

**EXPERIMENTAL**

*Film deposition and characterization*

Epitaxial NaNbO$_3$ films were grown by liquid-delivery spin MOCVD on 0.1° off-oriented NdGaO$_3$(110), DyScO$_3$(110), TbScO$_3$(110), and GdScO$_3$(110) single crystal substrates. Before introducing the perovskite substrates into the reactor chamber, they were annealed in pure oxygen gas flow at 1050°C for NdGaO$_3$, GdScO$_3$, and DyScO$_3$ and at 1150°C for TbScO$_3$ in order to generate a regular step-and-terrace surface structure with ~200 nm broad atomically smooth terraces and step heights of one monolayer (~4 Å).\textsuperscript{31,32} All NaNbO$_3$ films with thickness ranging from ~10 nm to 140 nm were deposited at a substrate temperature of 700°C and an O$_2$ to Ar ratio in the gas phase of 0.63 at a gas pressure of 2.6 × 10$^3$ Pa. The Na(thd) ((thd) = 2,2,6,6-tetramethyl-3,5-heptanediene) and Nb(ET$_3$O)$_5$ ((ET$_3$O = penta-ethoxide) metal-organic precursors dissolved in dry toluene with a concentration of 0.01 M were evaporated at 230°C and 190°C, respectively, and transported by Ar as carrier gas into the reactor chamber via a showerhead. More details of the deposition parameters are described in Ref. 33.

Strain state and film thickness were assessed by high-resolution x-ray diffraction (HRXRD). A precollimating parabolic multilayer mirror was employed in front of a multilayer mirror was employed in front of a resolution x-ray diffraction (HRXRD). A precollimating parabolic multilayer mirror was employed in front of a multilayer mirror was employed in front of a resolution x-ray diffraction (HRXRD). A precollimating parabolic multilayer mirror was employed in front of a reciprocal space maps (RSM) were recorded by using a linear position sensitive detector which simultaneously measured the direction of the diffracted beam with an accuracy of about 0.01°. The RSMs were taken by a single rocking scan of the sample while the detector was kept fixed. For further details of this technique, see Ref. 34. From the RSMs, the out-of-plane and in-plane lattice parameters of the films were determined taking the well known Bragg reflections of the substrate as reference. The position sensitive detector can be also used as a single channel detector, and x-ray rocking curves were measured in symmetrical scattering geometry for complementary information for the out-of-plane strain.

In order to obtain more detailed information about the in-plane lattice strains in the NaNbO$_3$ films, grazing incidence x-ray diffraction (GIXRD) were performed by using highly brilliant synchrotron radiation at BW2 beam line at HASYLAB/DESY and at KMC-2 beam line at BESSEY. The glancing angle of incidence was chosen close to the critical angle of total external reflection with the aim to adapt the x-ray penetration depth to the film thickness.

The surface morphology of the films was analyzed via atomic force microscopy (AFM, Asylum Research MFP$^3$D stand alone). The respective domain structures and local effective piezoelectric out-of-plane responses (d$^{33}_{zz}$) were analyzed by the piezoresponse force microscope (PFM) setup of the AFM utilizing the dual ac resonance tracking (DART) mode.\textsuperscript{35} Piezoelectric characterization of the domains was performed by in-plane (lateral PFM or LPFM) as well as out-of-plane (vertical PFM or VPFM) measurements. In-plane measurements were conducted in two in-plane alignments, which differ by an in-plane rotation of the sample by 90° (x-LPFM and y-LPFM).

**Transformation from orthorhombic lattice parameters to pseudocubic lattice parameters**

Bulk NaNbO$_3$ crystallizes at RT in the P phase with orthorhombic crystal symmetry (a$_0$ = 5.569 Å, b$_0$ = 5.505 Å, and c$_0$ = 15.523 Å).\textsuperscript{36} Pbcm setting. However, for the description of non-cubic perovskite materials, the lattice parameters are often given in pseudocubic notation. In our earlier publication,\textsuperscript{33} we neglected that anisotropic strain is introduced when a film with unequal in-plane lattice parameters is grown on a cubic or even orthorhombic substrate; only the average in-plane strain was considered. Since, however, in-plane anisotropy is crucial for domain formation here we use the relationship between the orthorhombic and pseudocubic systems given in Ref. 37. On the basis of these considerations, we have calculated the pseudocubic lattice parameters of NaNbO$_3$ to a$_c$ = 3.881 Å, b$_c$ = 3.915 Å, and c$_c$ = 9.07 Å. A schematic presentation of the orthorhombic Pbcm and the inscribed pseudocubic unit cell is shown in Fig. 1(a). In the following, the suffixes “c” and “o” are used for the pseudocubic and the orthorhombic notation, respectively.

**Lattice mismatch and film orientation on the different substrates**

Epitaxial growth on lattice mismatched substrates leads to elastic deformations in films. For a thin film with homogeneous strain the effect of strain on the free energy density is generally described by using Hooke’s law\textsuperscript{38}

\[
F(\varepsilon) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{klmn} C_{klmn} \varepsilon_{kl} \varepsilon_{mn} \quad \text{with} \quad k, l, m, n = x, y, z, \quad (1)
\]

where $C_{klmn}$ and $\varepsilon_{kl}$ denote the elastic coefficients of the film and the strain tensor, respectively. For epitaxial, biaxially
strained film growth with traction-free surfaces and without shear strain, the strain tensor is reduced to the two in-plane normal components $\varepsilon_{xx}$ and $\varepsilon_{yy}$ corresponding to the lattice mismatch between film (bulk lattice parameter: $a_f$) and substrate material (lattice parameter: $a_s$) defined by

$$
\varepsilon = (a_f - a_s)/a_f.
$$

Since film and substrates have an orthorhombic symmetry, the normal components $\varepsilon_{xx}$ and $\varepsilon_{yy}$ are non-equal. We have estimated the free energy density for NaNbO$_3$ film growth on the different substrates taking into consideration that (i) the NaNbO$_3$ thin films can be deposited with (100)$_c$, (010)$_c$, or (001)$_c$ surface orientation and (ii) two variants, which differ by an in-plane rotation of 90°, are possible. Principally, six different variations are possible, however, since $b_c$ is equal to $c_c$ from the elastic point of view, the number of independent configurations is reduced: on the one hand, for $a_c$ oriented films 90° in-plane variants are not distinguishable and on the other hand, $b_c$ oriented and $c_c$ oriented films exhibit the same in-plane parameters. Hence, due to symmetry reasons only three independent orientations of NaNbO$_3$ have to be considered and are given in Table I. Since data for NaNbO$_3$ are not available the elastic coefficients for KNbO$_3$ are used for this quantification. From Table I, it can be inferred that NaNbO$_3$ thin films on NdGaO$_3$ substrates will grow with (001)$_c$ surface orientation under compressive strain, while tensile in-plane strain and (100)$_c$ film orientation is favored to be incorporated in films on the rare-earth scandates.

### Table I. Lattice parameters of the surface unit cell of the different oxide substrates and calculated free energy densities (in GPa) according to Eq. (1) for the three different variants of strained NaNbO$_3$ thin films. In the right column, the in-plane lattice mismatches $\varepsilon_{xx}$, $\varepsilon_{yy}$ for the film orientation with the lowest free energy density (grey highlighted) are given. The suffixes “c” and “o” label the pseudocubic notation of the NaNbO$_3$ films and the orthorhombic coordinate system of the substrates, respectively.

| Substrate      | In [1-10]$_o$ direction | In [001]$_o$ direction | In-plane: (010)$_c$ ||[-110]$_c$ and (001)$_c$ ||[001]$_c$ | In-plane: (100)$_c$ ||[-110]$_c$ and (010)$_c$ ||[001]$_c$ | In-plane: (010)$_c$ ||[-110]$_c$ and (001)$_c$ ||[001]$_c$ | In-plane lattice mismatch $\varepsilon_{xx}$ in [1-10]$_o$ / $\varepsilon_{yy}$ in [001]$_o$ |
|----------------|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| NdGaO$_3$(110) | 2 $\times$ 3.863         | 2 $\times$ 3.854       | 7.40 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$ | 4.29 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$   | 4.38 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$     | 4.38 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$     | 3.58 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$         | 1.34 / 0.69                      |
| DyScO$_3$(110) | 2 $\times$ 3.947         | 2 $\times$ 3.952       | 2.76 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$ | 6.10 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$   | 8.70 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$     | 8.70 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$     | 6.84 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$         | -0.81 / -0.94                    |
| TbScO$_3$(110) | 2 $\times$ 3.960         | 2 $\times$ 3.959       | 4.52 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$ | 8.70 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$   | 8.70 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$     | 8.70 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$     | 9.35 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$         | -1.14 / -1.12                    |
| GdScO$_3$(110) | 2 $\times$ 3.970         | 2 $\times$ 3.966       | 6.39 $\times$ 10$^{-2}$ | 1.13 $\times$ 10$^{-1}$   | 1.13 $\times$ 10$^{-1}$     | 1.19 $\times$ 10$^{-1}$     | 1.40 $\times$ 10$^{-1}$         | -1.40 / -1.29                    |
vicinity of the (444)\( _{h} \) reflection peak of the orthorhombic substrates. Identical results were achieved also in [1–10] \( _{o} \) direction in the vicinity of the (260)\( _{o} \) and (620)\( _{o} \) substrate Bragg peaks, which are not shown here. Careful evaluation of the peak position of the film contributions in the 2\( \theta \)–\( \omega \) scans in Fig. 2 proves that the 2\( \theta \) angle of the film peak decreases, and accordingly, the out-of-plane lattice parameter of the films \( d_{\perp} \) successively increases with decreasing in-plane lattice parameters of the film (see arrows on the 2\( \theta \) axis in Fig. 2 and Table II, respectively). Furthermore, the lattice mismatch between NaNbO\(_{3}\) and the different used substrates has a decisive influence not only on the strain state, but also on the surface orientation of the films. From the position of the film Bragg peaks relative to the substrate Bragg peaks and the position of unstrained (001)\(_{h} \) and (100)\(_{h} \) oriented NaNbO\(_{3}\), we conclude that films on NdGaO\(_{3}\) are grown with (001)\(_{h} \) surface orientation under compressive strain, while the application of the rare-earth scandates as substrates leads to (100)\(_{h} \) oriented film growth under tensile lattice strain. These results agree well with the findings from elasticity theory given from Table I. Since in-plane lattice parameters of the substrates are not equal, all films are anisotropically strained (see also Table I, \( e_{xx} \) and \( e_{yy} \)).

Figures 4 and 5 show the morphology of NaNbO\(_{3}\) films on the different substrates and the phase images of VPFM and LPFM measurements in the two orthogonal in-plane directions (x-LPFM and y-LPFM) of \( \approx 30 \) nm thick films on the different substrates. All films exhibit very smooth surfaces with an average roughness \( \leq 0.3 \) nm. Domain patterns can be observed for all samples, however, depending on the choice of substrate the PFM results differ significantly in signal strength as well as in shape and alignment of the domains. In the following sections the results obtained for the different strain states (i.e., compressive strain for films on NdGaO\(_{3}\) and tensile strain for films on the rare-earth scandates) will be discussed separately. The emphasis of this discussion lies on the domain formation and its relation to the phase symmetry of the epitaxially grown films.

### Fully compressively strained films on NdGaO\(_{3}\)

For thin films (\( d \approx 10 \) nm), the RSM image reveals that both in-plane components of the scattering vectors of the NaNbO\(_{3}\)(024)\(_{h} \) and (204)\(_{h} \) Bragg reflections are identical to those of the (444)\(_{h} \) and (260)\(_{h} \) reflections of the NdGaO\(_{3}\) substrate (exemplarily shown for (444)\(_{h} \) in Fig. 3(a)). This proves fully coherent film growth of NaNbO\(_{3}\) on the NdGaO\(_{3}\) substrate. Also high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (HRTEM) images, shown in our recent publication,\(^3\) confirm pseudomorphic film growth on NdGaO\(_{3}\). The HRTEM data of the film can be simulated by an orthorhombic \( Pmc2_{1} \) structure with the orthorhombic [100]\(_{h} \) axis parallel to the surface normal. We choose here a pseudocubic unit cell of NaNbO\(_{3}\) which is inscribed in the orthorhombic \( Pmc2_{1} \) unit cell such that the [001]\(_{h} \) axis coincides with the orthorhombic [100]\(_{h} \) axis and the pseudocubic cell is rotated in-plane by 45°, i.e., [100]\(_{h} \) \( \parallel [110]_{i} \) and [010]\(_{h} \) \( \parallel [011]_{i} \) (see Fig. 1(b)). The \( Pmc2_{1} \) is a polar phase, which belongs to the point group \( mm2 \) with polar axis in \( (111)_{h} \) in the orthorhombic system\(^2\) (and accordingly in \( (101)_{h} \) in the pseudocubic unit cell). It has also been observed by Shiratori et al.\(^{4} \) for submicrocrystalline NaNbO\(_{3}\) particles under ambient pressure.

Vertical and lateral PFM amplitude measurements indicate the existence of both a very strong out-of-plane and an in-plane component of the polarization. This agrees well with the fact that the polarization direction of an orthorhombic
Partially relaxed films on NdGaO$_3$

With increasing film thickness ($d \geq 15\, \text{nm}$), film lattice starts to relaxably relax by the formation of defects. This is manifested by a decrease of the out-of-plane lattice parameter with increasing thickness.\textsuperscript{33} Up to a thickness of $\sim 30\, \text{nm}$, the RSMs recorded in the vicinity of the (260)$_o$ and (444)$_o$ Bragg reflections of the NdGaO$_3$ substrate show single (204)$_c$, and (024)$_c$ film reflection peaks only, which are slightly broadened and shifted to higher $q_{\text{100}}$ values due to the onset of plastic strain relaxation. This implies that the orthorhombic phase is still retained.

With further increased film thickness, we still observe a single (024)$_c$ film contribution, while the (204)$_c$, NaNbO$_3$ film peak is equally split (shown for a $50\, \text{nm}$ thick film in Fig. 7). The splitting of a $(h0l)_c$ reflection peak points to the formation of the monoclinic M$_A$ phase (notation of Vanderbilt and Cohen\textsuperscript{45} is used).\textsuperscript{46,47} In monoclinic M$_A$ phases, the polarization vector is aligned along (uuv)$_c$ with $u < v$ and can freely rotate in a [110]$_c$ plane. This is schematically presented in Fig. 6(a) by the arrow ending at point M$_A$.

Similar to the measurements on fully strained films, the PFM amplitude signal of $\sim 30\, \text{nm}$ thick films on NdGaO$_3$ confirms the presence of a strong vertical and a weaker lateral piezoresponse. The PFM phase images in Fig. 4(a) are typical for NaNbO$_3$ films grown on NdGaO$_3$ substrates with film thicknesses between 10 and $\sim 140\, \text{nm}$. The vertical phase image is uniformly dark seemingly implying that the polarization vector is exclusively directed into the film plane. The two orthogonal LPFM measurements indicate that the polarization vector is aligned in $[ \geq \text{uuv}]_c$ with $u < v$ (schematically presented in Fig. 4(b) by the two arrows) which is consistent with the M$_A$ symmetry derived from HRXRD.

The almost exclusive top-down arrangement of the polarization vector would be surprising suggesting the formation of a monodomain. This is, however, energetically unfavorable, when no bottom or top electrode is used. Wördenweber \textit{et al.} have shown that our compressively strained NaNbO$_3$ films on NdGaO$_3$ exhibit relaxor behavior.\textsuperscript{48} The assumption of a ferroelectric relaxor would explain the observation of strong vertical PFM amplitude signals together with a uniform phase image without contrast in an unpoled state. In relaxors, weakly interacting polar nanometer-size regions are formed, leading to low polarization contrast, uniformly distributed directions of the dipole moments and diffuse domain walls.\textsuperscript{44} Similar results have been described for compressively strained BiFeO$_3$ thin films on LaAlO$_3$ substrates\textsuperscript{47} and Bi$_{1-x}$Na$_{x}$TiO$_3$-BaTiO$_3$ ceramics,\textsuperscript{43} which exhibit likewise relaxor properties. Ongoing advanced experiments regarding the domain switching after DC poling and relaxation as well as temperature dependent PFM have also suggested relaxor behavior. These results go beyond the scope of this paper and will be described in a future publication.

Fully tensily strained films on ReScO$_3$ with Re = Dy, Tb, Gd

HRXRD reciprocal space maps of NaNbO$_3$ films on TbScO$_3$ substrates verify pseudomorph film growth up to a film thickness of about $20\, \text{nm}$.\textsuperscript{24} All films on TbScO$_3$ exhibit slightly reduced out-of-plane lattice parameters (between 3.849 Å and 3.864 Å for films with a thickness between 10 nm and 66 nm) compared to relaxed (100)$_c$ oriented NaNbO$_3$ which indicates the incorporation of tensile in-plane lattice strain. From GIXRD investigations, we

**FIG. 4.** (a) Morphology, vertical, and lateral PFM phase images of a $\sim 30\, \text{nm}$ thick NaNbO$_3$ film on NdGaO$_3$. x-PFM and y-PFM mark the two orthogonal in-plane scan directions, relative position of the cantilever to the sample is depicted in the left upper part of the PFM images. (b) Schematic presentation of the possible directions of the polarization vector.

nm2 phase is oriented along $\langle 111 \rangle_o$ in the orthorhombic unit cell (respective the $\langle 101 \rangle_c$ direction in the pseudocubic unit cell) and is schematically presented in Fig. 6(a) by the arrow which ends at point O. Since amplitude and phase images of the LPFM and VPFM measurements exhibit no contrasts and nearly no domain-related features are discernible, we do not show the PFM measurements on $10\, \text{nm}$ thin films here. The absence of any contrasts in PFM measurements also has been observed in literature for Bi$_{1/2}$Na$_{1/2}$TiO$_3$-BaTiO$_3$ derived ceramics\textsuperscript{43} and PbMg$_{1/3}$Nb$_{2/3}$O$_3$ thin films\textsuperscript{42} and was attributed to relaxor properties of the samples.

It should be noted that the occurrence of an in-plane polar component cannot be explained if the in-plane anisotropy of lattice strain is neglected. For isotropic biaxial strain, Diéguez \textit{et al.}\textsuperscript{11} predicted that highly compressively strained films exist in a ferroelectric phase with tetragonal symmetry. However, no lateral PFM response would be expected for such a tetragonal phase (corresponding polarization vector should end at point O in Fig. 6(a)) in contradiction to our PFM results.
concluded that these films consist of two types of monoclinic domains which differ by an in-plane monoclinic distortion $\pm \beta^*$ of the unit cell with respect to the [1-10]$_o$ (or [100]$_c$) direction$^{24}$ (see Fig. 8(a)). The monoclinic distortion angle $\beta^*$ increases with increasing film thickness and approaches the maximum value of $\beta^*_{\text{max}} \approx 0.67^\circ$ for a film thickness $d \approx 20$ nm. For even thicker films, $\beta^*$ remains at $\beta^*_{\text{max}}$ which is in agreement with the monoclinic bulk angle of $0.67^\circ$ reported for the P phase of NaNbO$_3$ at RT.$^{49}$ On the basis of GIXRD, we also established that the crystal lattice at domain walls between adjacent domains remains coherent. Similar results are obtained for fully strained films on DyScO$_3$ substrates,$^{50}$ where commensurate film growth is preserved for films up to a thickness of $\sim 30$ nm. This is attributed to the lower lattice mismatch (see Table I). Since the lattice mismatch for NaNbO$_3$ thin films on GdScO$_3$ substrate is still higher, we have observed the onset of plastic relaxation due to formation of defects (also displayed by the slight broadening of the film contribution in Fig. 3(d)) even for the thinnest film ($\sim 10$ nm film thickness).

PFM phase measurements on NaNbO$_3$ thin films on TbScO$_3$ and DyScO$_3$ exhibit quite similar features (Figs. 5(a) and 5(b), respectively). In the x-LPFM images, a pronounced arrangement of periodic stripes in [001]$_o$ (or [001]$_c$) direction with alternating dark and bright contrast can be observed, whereas the LPFM phase images in the orthogonal
direction (y-LPFM) show a lower contrast. The VPFM phase images exhibit only marginal variations. Together with relatively low piezoresponse amplitudes in VPFM, we suppose the absence of any vertical component of the polarization vector. The observed slight striation is attributed to a cross-talk between vertical and lateral channel detection caused by the strong lateral piezoresponse signal. From these results, we deduce that the polarization vector is aligned along the \( \langle 011 \rangle_c \) directions of the pseudocubic unit cell of NaNbO\(_3\) marked by red arrows in Fig. 8(a) (notice, that films on the ReScO\(_3\) substrates are \( \langle 100 \rangle_c \) oriented, i.e., the pseudocubic \( \langle 010 \rangle_c \) and \( \langle 001 \rangle_c \) directions are in the film plane, see Fig. 1(a)). However, since the lattice parameters of the film’s unit cell \( b_c \) and \( c_c \) are unequal due to the anisotropy of the substrate unit cell, the direction of the polarization is assumed to slightly deviate from the \( \langle 011 \rangle_c \). The polarization vectors between neighboring domains enclose an angle of almost 90° from which we infer an \( a_1/a_2 \) multi-domain configuration \( 24,51,52 \) (see schematic drawings in Fig. 8(a) and the lower arrows in Fig. 8(b), from bird view and side view, respectively).

Even though all films are deposited under the same deposition conditions, the films grown on the rare-earth scansdates are assumed to exhibit a slight deviation from the nominal stoichiometry. This is deduced for fully strained films from the change of the relative unit cell volume \( \Delta V/V = (V_f - V_b)/V_b \), where \( V_f \) and \( V_b \) are the unit cell volumes of the strained NaNbO\(_3\) film and of unstrained NaNbO\(_3\), respectively. From Table II, it is striking, that the film unit cell volumes are decreased (increased) for

![Fig. 6](image6.png)

FIG. 6. (a) Schematic presentation of the orientation of the polarization vector in the orthorhombic \( mm2 \) (O), the tetragonal (T) and the monoclinic \( M_A \) phase. (b) Trajectory of the polarization directions with increasing in-plane lattice parameter. “1” describes the phase transition pathway from the orthorhombic O to the monoclinic \( M_A \) phase, while path “2” has been observed for BiFeO\(_3\) films on LaAlO\(_3\) \( 46 \).

![Fig. 7](image7.png)

FIG. 7. X-ray reciprocal space maps of a 50 nm NaNbO\(_3\) film on a NdGaO\(_3\)(110)\(_o\) substrate in the vicinity of the \( (444)_{o} \) (a) and \( (260)_{o} \) (b) Bragg reflections.

![Fig. 8](image8.png)

FIG. 8. (a) Schematic drawing of the monoclinic unit cell of NaNbO\(_3\) (green) and the possible polarization vectors (red) from bird view (a). In (b) the alignment of the polarization vectors in fully strained films on the ReScO\(_3\) substrates only with an in-plane component (lower double arrows) and in partially relaxed films on a GdScO\(_3\) substrate with an in-plane and out-of-plane component (upper double arrows) are shown.
Compressively (tensilely) strained films on NdGaO	extsubscript{3} (on DyScO	extsubscript{3}, TbScO	extsubscript{3}, and GdScO	extsubscript{3}) substrates. This behavior can be explained within the framework of the linear theory of elasticity. However, while the experimentally determined $\Delta V/V$ for the compressively strained films on NdGaO	extsubscript{3} can be verified by typical Poisson ratios for perovskites, the observed volume changes $\Delta V/V$ for the films under tensile strain are significantly higher than expected from elasticity theory. This deviation points to a slight oxygen deficiency in these films and is attributed to the beneficial effect of the formation of oxygen vacancies in order to reduce the lattice mismatch for films which grow under tensile strain.57

**Partially relaxed films on ReScO	extsubscript{3} with Re = Dy, Tb, Gd**

PFM data in Figs. 5(a)–5(c) show that domain formation critically depends on the magnitude of lattice mismatch. Generally, the regular arrangement of the $a_1/a_2$ multi-domains in films of approximately equal film thickness is increasingly deteriorated with increasing lattice mismatch, i.e., from films on DyScO	extsubscript{3} (smallest lattice mismatch), to films on TbScO	extsubscript{3} to those on GdScO	extsubscript{3} (largest lattice mismatch).

While domains in $\sim 30$ nm thick films on DyScO	extsubscript{3} are well-ordered and continuous over several $\mu$m (Fig. 5(a)), the x-LPFM images of NaNbO	extsubscript{3} on TbScO	extsubscript{3} already exhibit some domain splitting (an example is marked by the arrow in x-LPFM image in Fig. 5(b)). A more complex pattern is observed for films on GdScO	extsubscript{3} (Fig. 5(c)). Here, the LPFM images reveal the occurrence of stripe domains also aligned in [1--10]$_{0}$ direction, displaying that 90° variants of the $a_1/a_2$ multi-domains have additionally been evolved. Corresponding GIXRD results (not shown here) point out that monoclinic domains occur which are distorted both in [1--10]$_{0}$, (or [100]$_{0}$) and [001]$_{0}$ (or [001]$_{0}$) direction. Furthermore, the VPFM phase images for films on GdScO	extsubscript{3} with $d \approx 30$ nm show high contrast between adjacent regions indicating a domain structure of alternating out-of-plane polarization.

The transition from a pure 1D stripe domain alignment to a 2D domain configuration, as indicated in the LPFM images in Fig. 5(c), is assumed to be caused by lattice relaxation and defect formation. Effect of plastic lattice relaxation, as a consequence of lattice mismatch between film and substrate material, can also be observed when film thickness is increased. This has been described in detail for a series of NaNbO	extsubscript{3} thin films with different thickness on TbScO	extsubscript{3} substrates in Ref. 24. We assume that the exclusive 1D arrangement of the stripe domains in thin fully strained films is provoked by the anisotropic tilting of the oxygen octahedra in the substrate. Thus, the symmetry of the ReScO	extsubscript{3}(110)$_{0}$ surfaces is not fourfold, but rather twofold according to the positions of the Re and O atoms. When the film lattice starts to relax and does no longer “feel” the asymmetry of the substrate’s bulk lattice, we suppose that a 2D arrangement develops since the energy difference for both configurations is supposed to be small. Since the lattice mismatch for NaNbO	extsubscript{3} thin films on GdScO	extsubscript{3} substrates is larger than for films on DyScO	extsubscript{3} and TbScO	extsubscript{3} substrates, even for the thinnest film on GdScO	extsubscript{3} (10 nm film thickness) the film lattice is partially relaxed resulting in a 2D domain pattern as revealed from the in-plane piezoresponse signal (Fig. 5(d)). For this film thickness ($\sim 10$ nm), any out-of-plane piezoresponse vanishes, indicating a 2D $a_1/a_2$ multi-domain configuration (schematically presented by the four double arrows on the bottom of the unit cell in Fig. 8(b)). However, with increasing film thickness increased formation of defects reduces the incorporated lattice strain and a significant enhancement of the out-of-plane piezoresponse with a resulting clear contrast between adjacent domains can be detected (Fig. 5(c)). Possible polarization vectors are schematically illustrated by the double arrows in the top part of the unit cell in Fig. 8(b) indicating the occurrence of a $(c + a_1/a_2)$ multi-domain state or $M_B$ domains.

**Strain induced domain transitions**

Up to here, we can summarize that the phase transition pathway from high compressive to high tensile lattice strain can be roughly sketched by the following sequence: $O \rightarrow M_A \rightarrow (c + a_1/a_2)$ or $M_B \rightarrow a_1/a_2$ (path 1 in Fig. 6(b)). Christen et al. reported, in parts, a resembling trajectory for compressively strained BiFeO$_3$ films which, however, starts from a tetragonal $T$ phase and pass to the rhombohedral $R$ phase (in the $R$ phase the polarization vector is aligned along the $(111)_c$ via the monoclinic $M_C$ and $M_A$ phases (path 2 in Fig. 6(b)). Instead of the orthorhombic $O$ phase in our system, they observed a quasi tetragonal $T$ phase which is caused by the equal in-plane dimensions of the LaAlO$_3$ lattice and the rhombohedral symmetry of unstrained BiFeO$_3$. In the $M_C$ phase, the polarization vector is rotated from the [001]$_d$ direction in the tetragonal phase towards [101]$_c$ and P is parallel to $(uO)_v$ as indicated by the arrow $M_C$ in Fig. 6(b). The existence of an intermediate $M_C$ phase where the polar vector is rotated away from the [101]$_c$ direction in the orthorhombic phase towards [001]$_d$ could not be verified by RSMs in our NaNbO$_3$ films.

The phase transition from the orthorhombic $O$ phase to the monoclinic $M_A$ phase and finally to the $a_1/a_2$ multi-domain phase in Fig. 6(b) provokes a rotation of the polarization vector with initially strong out-of-plane component to an exclusively in-plane arrangement. Thereby, it is obvious that the effective piezoelectric coefficient $d_{zz}^{\text{eff}}$ decreases with decreasing average in-plane strain as shown in Fig. 9. Simultaneously, we observed a transition from a ferroelectric relaxor in the $M_A$ phase (and presumably in the $O$ phase) in films under compressive lattice strain to a “normal” ferroelectric behavior in $(c + a_1/a_2)$ or $M_B$ and $a_1/a_2$ multi-domains in the films under tensile strain. Relaxor behavior in ABO$_3$ perovskites is typically evoked by compositional or charge disordering, but also incorporation of impurities or point defects like oxygen vacancies or related clusters can induce relaxor properties. Oxygen vacancies are expected to occur here rather in the NaNbO$_3$ films under tensile lattice strain. However, no ferroelectric relaxor behavior has been observed in these films at temperatures up to RT, rather C-V measurements have displayed normal ferroelectric properties for films on DyScO$_3$ substrates.
commensurate films under high tensile strain $a_1/a_2$ multi-domains with an elongation of several μm with exclusive in-plane polarization have been found to be well-ordered only in [001]$_a$ direction of the orthorhombic substrates. The symmetry of compressively strained films changes from orthorhombic to monoclinic with decreasing lattice strain, which, in part, resembles the phase sequence nearby the morphotropic phase boundary in lead-containing oxides. Ferroelectric relaxor properties have been attributed to the lowering of symmetry and the related polarization instability. We conclude that due to the application of lattice strain and substrate induced anisotropy the occurrence of low-symmetry phases can be controlled, which provides the unique possibility to grow lead-free oxide films with improved electromechanical properties and anisotropic ferroelectric properties.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors would like to thank R. Uecker and his group at IKZ for providing us with high quality rare-earth scandate substrates, A. Devi from Ruhr-University Bochum for the synthesis of suitable precursors, D. Novikov (HASYLAB at DESY), I. Zizak and D. Többens (both BESSY) for assistance in the x-ray experiments, T. Remmele (IKZ) for fruitful discussions as well as S. Markschies and A. Kwasniewski (both IKZ) for technical support.


SUMMARY

We have shown that the targeted incorporation of anisotropic lattice strain in NaNbO$_3$ thin films crucially determines the formation of ferroelectric domains. The modification of the strain state of the films from compressive to tensile is accompanied at RT by the transition from weakly ordered domains, which are not resolvable and exhibit large out-of-plane piezoelectric coefficients, to a superposition of two-dimensionally arranged 90° domains. Finally, for

For the compressively strained films on NdGaO$_3$ substrates, which are assumed to be nearly stoichiometric, we exclude compositional and charge ordering as reasons for the observed relaxor behavior. It is more likely related to substrate induced phase instabilities. The partially relaxed films on NdGaO$_3$ exhibit the low-symmetry monoclinic phase M$_X$ where the polarization vector can freely rotate in the (110)$_c$ planes (Fig. 6(a) shows the situation with P in the (1-10)$_c$ plane) similar to the situation in lead containing perovskites nearby the morphotropic phase boundary like PbZr$_{1-x}$Ti$_x$O$_3$ or PbMg$_{1/3}$Nb$_{2/3}$O$_3$PbTiO$_3$. Furthermore, for the fully strained NaNbO$_3$ films on NdGaO$_3$ with mm2 symmetry it is known that the mm2 symmetry can easily be broken by an electric field that is applied in a non-polar direction (e.g., in out-of-plane direction [001]$_c$) which results in a monoclinic M$_X$ or M$_C$ symmetry. In such “rotator” phases the polarization rotation is the dominant mechanism of piezoelectric response. They often offer enhanced piezoelectric properties along non-polar directions and relaxor properties.

Reducing the compressive lattice strain and the transition to tensile lattice strain in the films lead to the occurrence of ferroelectric multi-domain states, as predicted for anisotropic tensile in-plane lattice strain, and an enhanced alignment of the polarization vector in the film plane. The crossover to “normal” ferroelectric behavior at RT is tentatively explained by a shift of the transition temperature to higher values as it is known for metal-oxide films under tensile lattice strain. In contrast, for compressive lattice strain the transition temperature for NaNbO$_3$ thin films is reduced to about 250 K.

FIG. 9. Effective piezoelectric coefficient $d_{33}$ for 10 nm NaNbO$_3$ films on different substrates as a function of the average in-plane strain.